

ABSTRACTS OF PRESENTED PAPERS FROM THE FIRST
COMBINED CONVENTION OF THE PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL
ASSOCIATION (59TH) AND THE SOCIETY FOR SCIENTIFIC
EXPLORATION (35TH), BOULDER, COLORADO, USA,
JUNE 19–24, 2016—PA PAPERS ONLY

[*EDITOR'S NOTE*: ABSTRACTS ARE SLIGHTLY EDITED, MOSTLY TO CONFORM TO THE
JOURNAL'S STYLE.]

A REVIEW OF PSI ACTIVITY IN THE DNA

Bradley Y. Bartholomew

This paper presents a general summary of psi experiments conducted with the DNA in the latter decades of the 20th century, particularly at the HeartMath Institute (HMI) in Boulder Creek, CA, by Dr. Glen Rein, relating to the ability of “healers” to affect the conformation of the DNA molecule simply by concentrating their mental and emotional powers of the brain and heart. In particular it was found that the intentional states of healers could change the molecular structure of water which in turn could alter the conformation of the DNA. Further to these findings about the relationship between water and DNA, this paper discusses a journal article by a team led by 2008 Nobel Prize for Medicine recipient Dr. Luc Montagnier, which describes an electromagnetic field in the DNA that is capable of being projected into water and which contains all the information of its sequence of bases in memory and is capable of reconstructing itself into the identical chemical molecule, provided the ambient electromagnetic environment in the water is maintained at a frequency of 7 Hz, which is in the same frequency window as alpha rhythm brainwaves and the natural Schumann resonance of the earth. This paper goes on to discuss new research in optogenetics where human beings have been able to modify gene expression with their alpha rhythm and mu rhythm brainwaves in the same frequency window as the Schumann resonance, simply by adopting different mental states, and takes note of the fact that these same alpha and mu rhythms are the main conduit frequency for brain computer interfaces (BCIs). The paper presents a general summary of earlier research relating to psi phenomena resulting from interference of brainwaves with the Schumann resonance, and proposes a novel explanation for the recently discovered “mirror neurons” phenomena where the mu rhythm brainwaves emanating from the motor cortex are able to interfere constructively or destructively with the Schumann resonance of the same frequency and thus bring about mental telepathic as well as psychokinetic happenings.

EXPLORATORY STUDY OF PHYSIOLOGICAL CONNECTEDNESS
AMONG TWINS IN RELATION TO ATTACHMENT

Göran Brusewitz¹, Adrian Parker², David Luke¹, Annekatriin Puhle³, & Ross Friday¹

Parapsychological research into distant interactions between individuals seems to indicate that the bond between sender and receiver is important. The present study was designed to investigate the ostensible relationship between telepathy and attachment between twins. By applying the concept of attachment from developmental psychology, this becomes the second in our series of studies in parapsychology to explore the degree of attachment between twins as a potential dependent variable relating to their apparent telepathic connection. At the current stage of evaluating a new methodology, we report the design and findings

of this exploratory study. From an initial pool of 40 pairs of twins, six pairs of identical and one pair of non-identical twins were selected on the basis of their responses to the *Exceptional Experiences Questionnaire* and on the availability of both twins to take part in the study. The test procedure required each of them to alternate in the role of sender, in which they were exposed to a shock or surprise stimulus and in the role of receiver in which they were physiologically monitored for their electrodermal responses (EDR). Senders were presented with altogether five stimuli, one stimulus during each of the five trials per twin run. For each trial, the stimulus was presented during a 30 second period randomly chosen from eight possible such epochs within a four-minute trial. With a further 30 seconds added to establish baselines before and after each trial, this meant each trial would last five minutes. Graphs from 53 of the useable trials belonging to seven pairs of twins were analyzed by the lead researcher (GB), who was blind to the time epochs in which the stimuli had been presented by the researcher working with the senders (AP). The task for the lead researcher was to identify a peak of the graph in the receiver's reaction that might approximately correspond to the midpoint in the period that the stimulus had been presented to the sender. In 12 trials out of 53, these identifications corresponded to the actual exposure period for the shock or surprise stimulus—constituting so-called “hits,” compared to the MCE = 6.625 and was significant, $p = .043$ (one-tailed). Three out of these 12 correct placements were contributed by just one of the twins. The attachment data that twins contributed via the EEQ questionnaire indicated that all the twins in the current study seemed to experience similar high levels of attachment. This consistency in strong and close relationships meant of course there was a lack of variance as concerns the hypothesis that attachment would predict the scores. The results of the *Experiences in Close Relationships-Revised* (ECR) indicated that all the twins had very low scores on attachment-related anxiety and avoidance in their relationships. The profiles of twins having many hits in the telepathy experiment as regards any aspects of attachment were not significantly different from those of the others. The data provides justification for a major study using this methodology with selected pairs of twins. Some major improvements in the design were suggested. The synchronous monitoring of the electrodermal activity for the sender will later be carried out, giving possibilities to give a precise record of the timing and the effect of the shock stimuli.

¹*Department of Psychology and Counselling
Greenwich University, London, UK*

²*Department of Psychology
University of Gothenburg, Gothenburg, Sweden*

³*University of Gothenburg, Sweden*

VISUAL CATEGORIZATION OF IMAGES OF FACIAL PHOTOGRAPHS BY INTUITIVE INDIVIDUALS

Arnaud Delorme^{1,2,3}, Alan Pierce³, Leena Michel³, & Dean Radin³

Some individuals claim to be adept at gauging mortality based on a glance at a person's photograph. To test this claim, we invited 12 such individuals to see if they could determine if a person was alive or dead based solely on a brief examination of photos of faces. All photos used in the experiment were transformed into a uniform gray scale and then counterbalanced across eight categories: gender, age, gaze direction, glasses, head position, smile, hair color, and image resolution. Participants examined 404 photographs displayed on a computer monitor, one photo at a time, each shown for a maximum of 8 seconds. Half of the individuals in the photos were deceased, and half were alive at the time the experiment was conducted. Participants were asked to press a button if they thought the person in a photo was alive or deceased. Overall mean accuracy on this task was 53.8%, where 50% was expected by chance ($p < .004$, two-tailed). Statistically significant accuracy was independently obtained in five of the 12 participants. We also collected 32-channel electrophysiological recordings and observed a robust difference between images of deceased individuals correctly versus incorrectly classified in the early event related potential at 100 ms poststimulus onset. Our

results support claims of individuals who report that some as yet unknown features of the face predict mortality. The results are also compatible with claims about clairvoyance.

¹*Paul Sabatier University, Toulouse, France*

²*University of California, San Diego, CA, USA*

³*Institute of Noetic Sciences, Petaluma, CA, USA*

SPIRITUALLY TRANSFORMATIVE EXPERIENCES OF CLAIMANT MEDIUMS

William G. Everist

This qualitative study was designed to establish a comprehensive understanding of the initial experience associated with the spiritual transformation process of *inexperienced claimant mediums*, commonly described as individuals who allegedly have regular communications with the deceased. Spiritually transformative experiences are commonly thought to be a type of transformation and expansion of consciousness. Often referred to as *psychic openings*, these experiences have occasionally been described as being startling or traumatic, sometimes creating a loss of contact with consensual reality that may possibly lead to psychiatric misdiagnosis in the individual's search for an understanding of the experience. Consequently, the desired outcome of this study was to establish a better understanding of the initial psychic opening and propose a more reasoned approach to its acknowledgement and development by the scientific community. A five-part review of the background literature in the field of study focused on a history of the practice of mediumship, the proposed psycho-spiritual emergence process, the child's perspective of his or her spiritual development process via an archival biographical analysis of the psychic opening, the subsequent development of the medium's purported abilities, and a review of recent process-oriented mediumship studies. Six participants for this study were selected from a group of certified research mediums prescreened for their abilities by the Windbridge Institute for Applied Research in Human Potential in Tucson, Arizona. A semistructured questionnaire in compliance with Saybrook Institutional Review Board oral history specifications was utilized as the primary research instrument to provide biographical accountability. However, additional written documentation of the experience was included when appropriate to further clarify the psychological impact of the psychic opening. A thematic analysis of the data revealed that the participants' transformative experiences consisted of a sequence of developmental experiences that included an encounter with a single or multiple spiritual entities that one may or may not consider as spirit guides. Depending upon the age of the participant and the existing social support system at the time of the initial experience, the spiritual encounter can be either fearfully traumatic or merely an anomalistic variation of the individual's concept of reality.

Saybrook University, Oakland, CA, USA

THE DIALOGUED CAPTURE: ANALYSIS AND APPLICATION OF ROE & ROXBURGH'S HIERARCHICAL MODEL OF COLD READING STRATEGIES DURING PSYCHIC READINGS

Renaud Evrard

A surprisingly high proportion of the population has attended readings by professional "psychics" or "mediums," but this situation has received little attention from psychologists (Roe, 1995; Wooffitt, 2006). Some authors have considered parallels between the psychic reading and more orthodox forms of psychotherapy, even calling it a "poor man's psychoanalysis" (Miller, 1995). What could these situations have in common? An implicit consensus reduced the dialogue between the pseudopsychic and its client to a "cold reading" or a "dialogued capture," as coined by the French sociologist Bertrand Méheust (2004), which didn't involve any paranormal process of information acquisition. But these allusions to "cold reading" tend to be

vague and inconsistent, and such an application of the term will cause it to lose any explanatory power it has. According to psychologist Ray Hyman (1981), “The cold reading employs the dynamics of the dyadic relationship between psychic and client to develop a sketch that is tailored to the client. The reader employs shrewd observation, nonverbal and verbal feedback from the client, and the client’s active cooperation to create a description that the client is sure penetrates to the core of his or her psyche.” There are also clear indications that the cold reading “process” actually consists of a number of discrete and independent strategies. Psychologists Chris Roe and Elizabeth Roxburgh (2013) have developed a hierarchical model of all reading strategies based on the amount of interaction between the psychic and the sitter and the generality of the information. Their model gathers both declarative (Barnum statements, specific trivia, specific generalisations, pigeon holing, warm reading, fishings, “true” cold reading) and manipulative strategies (setting the stage, try-ons, Procrustean effect reinforcements, hot reading, misrecall induced by diversion, back-channel behaviors). The aim of our paper is to describe this model and its limits, to suggest some refinements, and to apply it through the dialogue analysis of a psychic reading. Hyman (1981) notes that although it is unlikely that the pseudopsychic reading will generate information that is truly new to the client, it may still have utility for him or her as a therapeutic, quasi-counselling event. As such, its analysis can help us better understand the development of an alliance in verbal psychotherapies.

*Center for Information, Research, and Counseling on Exceptional Experiences
University of Lorraine, Nancy, France*

FIGHT AND FLIGHT: TOWARD A PSYCHODYNAMIC MODEL OF NEAR-DEATH EXPERIENCES

Renaud Evrard¹, Chloé Toutain², & Jacob W. Glazier³

Historically, NDEs have been the subject of several psychological or psychoanalytic interpretations. However, they are now in competition with neuroscientific and medical approaches. Since Heim’s first observations, NDEs were discussed in the general framework of clinical practice and trauma by philosophers such as Victor Egger and by psychoanalysts such as Oskar Pfister and Sandor Ferenczi. Surprisingly, until the work of Russell Noyes and his collaborators in the 1970s, the findings focused on elements that were no longer phenomenologically in line with Moody’s work. OBE, panoramic memory, elation, and transcendental elements were in fact narrated by a portion of the experiments; yet, a majority claimed to have first felt a form of hyperalertness and automatism and to have been capable of acrobatic and intellectual performances thereby facilitating their own life-saving rescue efforts. Heim’s own testimony describes such efforts. In an attempt to build a psychodynamic model to reconcile these different aspects without falling into a form of reductionism, we begin with a diachronic exploration of the literature regarding the rescue actions during NDE. This process indicates both the traditional description of passing into a disembodied consciousness while, simultaneously, encountering a new concept we call hyperembodied consciousness. Noyes et al. interpreted this process as an almost universal reaction to life-threatening danger and a basic adaptive pattern of the nervous system akin to Cannon’s fight-or-flight reactions. To integrate their ideas in a new psychodynamic model, the second part of this article discusses on a synchronic axis both old and new literature on NDEs, focusing on several conceptual issues: the psychological versus biological triggers of NDEs, the notion of *fear-death experiences*, the description of the disjunction between a disembodied and a hyperembodied consciousness; the complementarity of the processes of *focalization* (fight) and *distanciation* (light) through the contribution of the Bergsonian theory of the body-mind relationship; and the psychodynamic functions and nature of the survival scenario experienced through the distanciation. We propose to reconsider the NDEs as part of a more general process: an adaptive psychosomatic response to the perception of imminent death, while discussing a case of drowning.

¹ *Center for Information, Research, and Counseling on Exceptional Experiences*

University of Lorraine, Nancy, France

² *University of Strasbourg, Strasbourg, France*

³ *University of West Georgia, Carrollton, GA, USA*

ANOMALOUS MECHANICAL EFFECT ON AN EXPERIMENTAL TABLE-TIPPING SÉANCE: A MULTIMODAL APPROACH

Juan Gimeno, Darío Burgo, & Alejandro Parra

Between June 2014 to December 2015, a number of table-tipping séances were organized in (city name). Up to five video cameras were installed to record the events. Various devices were assembled to measure physical, physiological, psychological, and environmental variables. Twenty-three meetings were held with a subject about whom anomalous movements (vertical and horizontal) of a table incidentally had been discovered in previous observations. The subject (AF) was presumably capable of moving a table at will through an alleged “PK force.” The phenomena were documented and recorded on several occasions. Muscle effort was ruled out as the cause of the movements (unconscious or conscious fraud). A multimodal approach was used, including EEGs records, anomalous effects on the RNG, and other data analysis with the subject at rest and also during experimental table-tipping séances. The normal curve of an RNG deviated significantly ($p = .008$). No variations of electric and magnetic fields were found associated with the phenomena. Contactless movement of the table or other objects could not be achieved.

Instituto de Psicología Paranormal, Buenos Aires, Argentina

MULTIPLE-ANALYSIS CORRELATION STUDY BETWEEN HUMAN PSYCHOLOGICAL VARIABLES AND BINARY RANDOM EVENTS

Hartmut Grote

Mind-matter interaction experiments have been progressing from targeting simple bias of random number generators to correlation studies between psychological and physical variables, carried out over multiple combinations of these.

This paper reports on a new correlation study between human intention and the output of a binary random number generator. The study comprises a total of 720,000 bits from 20 equal sessions each on a different human participant. Each participant spent 1 hour of time attempting to “influence” the outcome of the random number generator according to a preselected intention. During this time the participant was provided feedback on his/her performance by an analog mechanical display, with the needle of a galvanometric instrument moving to the left or right hand side of its current position, according to the instantaneous output of the random number generator. Psychological variables were obtained from the participants by a hardware dial before each individual run and by a questionnaire before the participant’s first experimental session.

Three types of data analysis were defined and tested before looking at the data. The first analysis looks at the distribution of results from the participants. A former study of this kind had found a significant result for this type of analysis. The second analysis tests for correlations between psychological variables obtained before each run and physical variables of the corresponding subsequent run. The third analysis is a conceptual replication of von Lucadou’s correlation matrix method. It consists of multiple correlation tests between psychological and physical variables arranged in a matrix, which also can be interpreted as a multiple-analysis technique.

The results of these analyses will be presented, putting this study into context with other experiments of this kind.

Max-Planck-Institut für Gravitationsphysik (Albert-Einstein-Institut)

*Leibniz-Universität Hannover
Hannover, Germany*

EXPLORATIONS INTO USING BRAIN SIGNALS TO PREDICT RANDOM FUTURE CONDITIONS

Jacob Jolij¹ & Dick Bierman²

Three studies are reported using a face-detection task where faces are presented (or not) with a dynamic noise mask, while the participant's EEG was measured. Each participant was exposed to 240 stimuli either "a face buried in noise" or "just noise, no face."

Four templates were created by averaging the EEG before and after stimulus presentation for face and no-face conditions. These templates we called anticipatory-before-face template (AF), anticipatory-before-no-face template (ANF), similarly response-to-face (RF) and response-to-no-face (RNF) templates. These templates were used to classify a specific EEG signal as being associated with the face or no-face (random) condition.

When using the templates constructed from the EEG signals measured after stimulus presentation (RF and RNF) this classification had an accuracy of 80%. Using the EEG patterns before the stimulus condition (AF and ANF) resulted in an accuracy of ~53%, where 50% is expected by chance ($p \ll .001$).

In order to explain this apparent anomalous effect where we can use anticipatory signals to predict the random future stimulus condition, randomness tests were performed on the sequence of conditions that the subject had been exposed to. Only one subject had been exposed to a significantly nonrandom condition sequence. Also the digital filter that had been used was excluded to be the source of the anomaly. When using the trial number as a factor in the analyses there are no interactions with that factor and hence there are no significant inclines in accuracy within a subject. This suggests that no learning (of patterns) occurred.

In all three studies there is a positive correlation between the anticipatory accuracy and the response accuracy, suggesting that there is some form of symmetry. Further analyses of these symmetries are in progress in order to differentiate between retrocausal and forward causal triggered correlations.

¹*University of Groningen, The Netherlands*

²*University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

DEVELOPING AN EXPERIMENTAL METHODOLOGY FOR APPARENT EXCEPTIONAL PK PARTICIPANTS

John G. Kruth

Two PK study participants have been studied at the Rhine Research Center at different times over the past four years. Both participants had demonstrated effects in other research situations, and they were invited to the Rhine to explore the apparent effects in a controlled situation. In tightly controlled environments, these participants apparently demonstrated consistent PK activity. The methods used to examine these phenomena are described as well as some new observations about PK activity.

One participant was examined using an Egely Wheel in a very controlled situation. The Egely Wheel was tested in detail to determine the effects of physical forces including heat, magnetism, static, light, and air flow, and with the necessary shielding the Egely Wheel was determined to be a valid instrument for PK testing.

Using the Egely Wheel, an apparent consistent effect was observed in sessions where the participant was less than 12 inches from the wheel, but no effect was measured from a greater distance. This distance limitation may be a limitation of the effect, but it is also possible that the limits are due to the beliefs and expectations of this specific participant. The discovery of a rebound effect in these sessions appears to

be an extension of the linger effect observed in earlier healing studies.

Participant number two apparently produced large effects on electronic devices from a distance. These effects were verified in a number of sessions with different devices. One series involving the Psyleron random event generator showed inconsistent results. Another series using a customized electronic device designed to detect electrical fields showed a clear effect on the device from distances of up to 4 meters. A third series utilized a photomultiplier tube that is a very sensitive instrument used to detect low level light, and when the light shutter was closed, the instrument continued to register large variations indicating an electronic disturbance in the equipment or the recording devices.

Some attempts were made to explore the mechanisms behind these effects including integrating into the process electrical shielding, distance, visual cues, electrical grounding, and location changes. The results of these process-oriented sessions show that the effects are not affected by wooden barriers, but diminishing effects observed due to distance and electrical shielding may have been more the result of the beliefs and expectations of the participants than an actual limitation of the observed effect. Further research is necessary to explore the mechanisms behind the PK process in more detail and to mitigate the influence of the participants' beliefs on the measured effects.

Rhine Research Center, Durham, NC, USA

THE PARADIGM OF REFLEXIVE ANOMALISTICS

Gerhard A. Mayer & Michael T. Schetsche

Scientific anomalistics is a content-determined, and delimited, area of science committed to the application of appropriate scientific methodology as well as generally accepted, and necessary, scientific control mechanisms. The specification of research subjects is not the result of assignment to groups of phenomena of specific scientific (sub)disciplines but of the ascription of an anomalistic nature (at first), which makes these phenomena, or experiences, a subject of anomalistic research. Accordingly, anomalistics is not characterized by its own specific methodology, but it is oriented by the requirements of the respectively concerned discipline(s) : physics, chemistry, biology, psychology, sociology, science of history, and so forth. For a long time, (natural) science approaches have been considered paradigmatic for anomalistic research, and for parapsychological research in particular, but during the last decades, social-scientific approaches and qualitative research methods have increasingly gained in importance as supplementary and alternative methods. With that, single case studies and the investigation of ostensible spontaneous psi phenomena lost its often premature reputation of being unscientific. Qualitative research methodology, which is predominantly used in social and cultural sciences as well as in anthropology, represents a useful supplement to quantitative approaches; in some cases, and for several research questions, it proves to be ultimately superior because one can go without a considerable reduction of complexity which is obligatory for quantitative methods and, therefore, the research as well as the researchers can come much closer to living-worldly manifestations of anomalistic phenomena and experiences than is the case with the relatively artificial context situation in laboratory experiments. With this paper we present an analysis of the specific conditions of anomalistic research that we systematize under the paradigm of "reflexive anomalistics." The term signifies a social scientific informed approach to anomalistic phenomena that is aware of: (a) the epistemic particularities of the phenomena under research; (b) the precarious cultural (media, science policy) framework conditions of this research; and (c) the areas of tension between subjective evidence, scientific proof, and social discourse. These factors have systematically to be taken into consideration in developing the scientific research questions as well as the methodological approaches.

*Institut für Grenzgebiete der Psychologie und Psychohygiene e.V.
Freiburg im Breisgau, Germany*

SEEKING GENES GOVERNING ANOMALOUS EXPERIENCE: CORRELATIONAL MAPPING OF COMMUNITY SURVEY DATA

James McClenon

A pilot study was designed to locate genes governing anomalous experience. The study uses a variation of Pearlson and Folley's (2008) strategy for locating alleles (alternative forms of a gene governing hereditary variation) based on evolutionary theory. The pilot study was guided by two theories: (a) A sheep theory hypothesizes that ESP alleles provide sufficient benefits to overcome the costs of schizophrenia. (b) A ritual healing theory argues that genes governing absorption and dissociation provided evolutionary benefits to archaic humans exposed to childhood trauma and shamanic healing. The ritual healing theory hypothesizes that shamanic healing, practiced by Paleolithic hunter-gatherers over many millennia, selected for alleles shaping anomalous experience, hypnotic suggestion, shamanism, and spirituality (McClenon, 1997, 2002a). Pearlson and Folley (2008) propose correlational mapping (multidimensional analysis) of community survey data to analyze hypothesized allele markers. The pilot study discusses the sheep theory and ritual healing theory with regard to allele markers. These theories predict existence of alleles governing ESP, absorption, dissociation, transliminality, boundary scales, and other anomalous experiences. A questionnaire was designed to measure frequency of anomalous experience, psychological symptoms, shamanic variables, childhood and adolescent difficulty, and other variables thought correlated with psychological symptoms (McClenon, 2012, 2013). Between 2001 and 2006, the questionnaire was administered to a non-random community sample in northeastern North Carolina ($N = 965$). The hypothesized allele markers were evaluated through correlational mapping of the survey data. Findings are based on five correlational maps (previously unpublished): (a) Anomalous experience variables were highly correlated with each other. (b) Particular correlational clusters, which suggest possible underlying alleles, include "waking ESP, OBE, apparitions," "waking ESP, apparitions," and "waking ESP, paranormal dreams, apparitions." (c) Waking ESP and apparitions were highly correlated with shamanic variables but were generally not within shamanic variable correlational clouds. (d) Although waking ESP is highly correlated with schizophrenia symptoms, researchers have not uncovered major schizophrenia alleles. Failure to locate these alleles calls into question the sheep theory. (e) Cluster patterns suggest that the search for alleles associated with shamanic ritual will be fruitful. (f) Correlational mapping provides no evidence of a psi allele (waking ESP, paranormal dreams, PK). (g) Analysis provides a list of 16 variables most correlated with a "waking ESP, paranormal dreams, apparition" cluster. Although correlational mapping does not provide clear evidence for an ESP allele, these variables are possible allele markers. Pilot study results suggest theoretical revisions. A revised ritual healing theory hypothesizes that random genetic mutations are the source of anomalous experiences.

Virginia Beach Psychiatric Center, Chesapeake, VA, USA

PERSONALITY AND PERCEPTUAL VARIABLES ASSOCIATED WITH MEDIUMISTIC EXPERIENCES: EXAMINING TWO SAMPLES

Alejandro Parra

Spontaneous mediumistic experiences have not previously been tested in the general population or in specific groups. The aim of this study, therefore, was to evaluate two samples: paranormal believers ($N = 239$, 74% females and 26% males) and undergraduate students ($N = 554$, 77% females and 22% males) in terms of psychological variables related to mediumistic experiences such as a sense of presence, an apparitional experience, and spirit possession. A number of scales were used in both studies. For S1, the results showed that a sense of presence is the most frequent experience (75%), followed by an apparitional experience (24%) and spirit possession (19%). Only 41% had a type of mediumistic experience, of which 31% had two and 6% had at least three types of experience. Individuals with a higher frequency of mediumistic ex-

periences tended to be more extraverted, have a propensity to schizotypy (with an emphasis on the positive dimension rather than negative schizotypy), have more intense visual vividness, and score higher on thin boundary and transliminality compared to others within the same group that had psychic experiences but not mediumistic experiences. For S2, the results showed that a sense of presence was the most frequent experience (33%), followed by apparitional experience (5%), and spirit possession (4.7%). Individuals with a higher frequency of mediumistic experiences tended to be emotionally unstable, were prone to schizotypy (both positive and negative), and had a greater capacity to dissociate, compared to others within the same group who had psychic experiences but not mediumistic experiences.

Instituto de Psicología Paranormal, Buenos Aires, Argentina

EXPLORATORY STUDY OF THE TEMPERAMENT THEORY AND PARANORMAL EXPERIENCES

Alejandro Parra¹ & Juan Carlos Argibay²

Few studies explored traits of personality to explain paranormal experiences, so it's not surprising that connection has also been made between such simple experiences and a person's temperament. The aim is to compare four groups of temperaments in terms of frequency of paranormal experiences. From the usable questionnaires (1860, 21%), 403 undergraduate students (Psychology Department) were used for the categorization procedure, based on a mean score split of the sample, combined to produce four groups, Phlegmatic ($n = 30$), Sanguine ($n = 54$), Melancholic ($n = 159$), and Choleric ($n = 160$), using the standardized Spanish version of the *Eysenck Personality Inventory* (Form A). The sample filled out a second 10-item self-report inventory designed to collect spontaneous paranormal/anomalous experiences. Choleric scored highest on frequency of out-of-body experiences (OOBEs), ESP dreams, aura, déjà-vu, and number of experiences; Sanguines scored highest on telepathy, and Melancholics scored highest on frequency of a sense of presence. Certain anomalous experiences, such as OOBE, dream recall, and seeing auras could be facilitated by using extravert subjects characterized as touchy, restless, excitable, changeable, and impulsive.

¹*Instituto de Psicología Paranormal, Buenos Aires, Argentina*

²*Universidad Abierta Interamericana, Buenos Aires, Argentina*

EXPERIMENTER EFFECT AND REPLICATION IN PSI RESEARCH

Marilyn Schlitz³, Daryl J. Bem⁴, Eva Lobach⁸, Thomas Rabeyron⁷, William Bengston⁹,
Sky Nelson³, Serena Roney-Dougal⁵, Garret Moddel¹⁰,
Patrizio E. Tressoldi⁶, & Arnaud Delorme^{1,2,3}

This study addressed the replication problem in parapsychology through the examination of experimenter and participant belief in psi and their impact on the outcome of a psi task. The meta-study involved an international collaboration of teachers, student experimenters, and experimental volunteers, who made use of a standardized psi protocol that has been the focus of a number of replication attempts and that allows for a systematic collection of data under well-controlled conditions (Bem, 2011). It included 12 different laboratories across 32 experimenters and 512 participants. While the preregistered hypothesis that was assessed on a participant basis did not show a significant psi effect, when the statistical power was increased by using a single trial analysis, the primary hypothesis was highly significant. The results did not support a correlation between study outcome and experimenter expectancy. Overall, these results support the feasibility of a multilaboratory collaboration and show that single trial analysis might be more appropriate and powerful to process these types of data.

¹ *Paul Sabatier University, Toulouse, France*

² *University of California, San Diego, San Diego, CA, USA*

³ *Institute of Noetic Sciences, Petaluma, CA, USA*

⁴ *Cornell University, Ithaca, NY, USA*

⁵ *Psi Research Centre, Somerset, UK*

⁶ *University of Padua, Italy*

⁷ *University of Nantes, France*

⁸ *University of Amsterdam, The Netherlands*

⁹ *St Joseph College, New York, NY, USA*

BEM'S "FEELING THE FUTURE" (2011), FIVE YEARS LATER: ITS IMPACT ON SCIENTIFIC LITERATURE

Bruno A. Silva & Gabrielle Poeschl

The study analyses the impact on scientific literature of the controversial article by Bem "Feeling the Future" (2011). Texts ($N = 162$) that cite Bem's article were identified from the Elsevier Scopus database for the years 2011 to 2015. Aiming to complement more in-depth approaches to the controversies in parapsychology, we analyzed the summaries of these texts using the Iramuteq program for textual data. The analysis extracted four classes of vocabulary suggesting that the impact can be grouped in four different areas: (a) the role of replication in psychology research; (b) Bayesian statistical inference; (c) experimental studies in anomalous experiences; and (d) the quantum phenomena and theories. The "Replication" vocabulary class is characterized by a vocabulary that addresses the role of replication in psychology research. The lack of replication of some studies, along with questionable research practices, may have contributed to a crisis of credibility regarding psychological science. The "Bayesian" class points mainly to concepts related with the Bayesian approach. The text segments mainly reflected the perceived merits of this approach when compared with more traditional inferential statistics, namely statistics relying on p values. The "Experimental Studies in Anomalous Experiences" class includes frequent terms related to experimental studies and psi phenomena (e.g., remote viewing, precognition, prestimulus), but also terms related to specific methodologies (e.g., nonintentional precognition task, Go/NoGo task), and theory (PMIR: psi-mediated instrumental response). The citation of Bem's article (2011) is applied in a context of process-oriented research on anomalous experiences (experimental work, designed to find evidence about the characteristics of processes that underlie anomalous experiences), in opposition to proof-oriented research. Finally, the "Quantum Phenomena and Theories" set of terms suggests that quantum theories of brain/consciousness function may leave the door open to the possibility of the existence of psi phenomena. The fact that the Replication and Bayesian classes were more represented in psychology literature confirms our hypothesis that psychology sources would have a more critical position. Data still suggest that the replication path is currently the one that is mainly followed in the attempt to reach closure for this controversy.

Center for Psychology

University of Porto, Porto, Portugal

OF THE AMERICAN SOCIETY FOR PSYCHICAL RESEARCH ABSTRACTS

Sergii Vakal & Igor Bombushkar

Background. At the moment, only a few initial issues of the *Journal of the American Society for Psychical Research* (JASPR) and *Proceedings of the American Society for Psychical Research* (PASPR) that were published from 1907 to the beginning of the 21st century are available in a digital format over the Internet. To the best of our knowledge, JASPR and PASPR are among the few remaining parapsychological journals

that are not available to the community through Lexscien, Scopus, Informat, or other databases. Given that full JASPR archive comprises more than 662 issues with more than 3,500 papers over nearly 100 years, it goes without saying that such a mass of information should be accessible to the community. The availability of comprehensive digital archives and bibliographic databases is one of the most important factors determining the rate of information turnover within a specific field of study. A need for creation of a joint digital archive of all parapsychological publications has been claimed at the 58th Annual Convention of Parapsychological Association that was held in London last year. A year ago we obtained a large bundle of original issues of JASPR and PASPR from Dr. Hoyt Edge, and under the impression of efforts of Tremmel et al. (2015) to digitize the *Journal of Parapsychology*, we decided to make our own contribution to the community by digitizing abstracts from the available JASPR and PASPR issues. The digitization is being done on a voluntary basis.

Purpose. To digitize abstracts from all available issues of JASPR and PASPR, and provide them in a searchable form in order to increase the rate of information turnover within the parapsychological community.

Methods. First of all, we performed a careful search for digitized JASPR issues on the Internet in order to confirm the idea that a large portion of the issues of this journal is not available in digital format. Secondly, a list of all available original issues, and issues found on the Web, was created and saved as a table in csv format. Scanning of all abstracts was performed manually with the Samsung SCX-4100 multifunctional printer with Smarthru v.4 software on a Windows 7 operating system. We selected a black-and-white scanning setting in order to obtain pictures with high contrast—sharp black text on a white and clear background, with a resolution of 300 pixels per inch. Abstracts both from original papers and book reviews were scanned manually one by one by the staff of the UCPR from January to March 2016. Each abstract was saved as a separate jpeg file in the highest available quality and put in the folder of the corresponding issue. In the next stage we performed manual horizontal alignment and edging of each picture with Adobe Photoshop CS5 v.12.1 in order to obtain files suitable for optical character recognition. The digital images of markings, inscriptions, and coarse dirt were erased manually. Since most of the pictures were of a good quality, further processing was not needed. Each picture was processed in ABBYY FineReader 12 Professional in order to recognize the characters. Each abstract was extracted and pasted to the same plain text file with the following fields: Title of the Paper, Authors, Journal Title, Year of Publication, Volume, Issue, Pages, Abstract Text, Key Words. As a result, we will get a single text file containing more than a thousand abstracts from JASPR issues in fully searchable form.

Results. All abstracts from 114 issues of JASPR and 3 volumes of PASPR were digitized during the project. Besides, 192 issues of JASPR and 16 volumes (19 issues) of PASPR were found on the Internet and were subjected to optical character recognition. Each abstract was categorized into one of the following types: Original Paper, Review, Book Review, Letter to Editor, Bibliography, Recollections, and Discussion. At the moment, we have processed all abstracts in digital format and 60% of them are fully processed. As a result, by the end of May, we will get more than 1,700 abstracts from 130 JASPR issues and 19 PASPR volumes in easily accessible and searchable form.

Conclusions. The electronic searchable archive with more than 1,700 abstracts from 306 issues of JASPR and 22 issues of PASPR was constructed and archived on the server of the Ukrainian Center for Parapsychological Research.

Ukrainian Center for Parapsychological Research, Kyiv, Ukraine

THERE IS NO GATE: ON THE PA AND THE AAAS

Annalisa Ventola

The 1979 national meeting of the American Association for the Advancement of Science (AAAS) played host to one of the most retold stories in the history of field of parapsychology—when John Archibald

Wheeler, a theoretical physicist, veered off the stated program of his symposia and used part of his presentation time to launch an attack on the Parapsychological Association (PA), calling for its dismissal from the AAAS. His inappropriate outburst did not succeed in achieving this aim; it only strengthened the PA's affiliation with the AAAS. However, it did succeed in obscuring the successes of the dozens of other parapsychology papers presented at AAAS national meetings for years prior, the encouraging interactions that they stimulated, and the positive trajectory of the field up until that point.

This paper summarizes the history of parapsychological topics presented in *Science* magazine and AAAS meeting symposia from the first mention of the word *parapsychology* in *Science* (1937) to last psi-related symposia to take place at a national meeting (1993). Looking through these materials, the integration of parapsychology into the wider scientific community appears to have proceeded—at least for a time—in a linear and continuous way. In the decades prior to the PA's formal affiliation with the AAAS, *Science* magazine was already serving as a mouthpiece for the developing field of parapsychology by reprinting its most important announcements, such as the start of the *Journal of Parapsychology* and the formation of the PA. This was followed by a decade of symposia, which launched with an orientation to the very basics of psi research and increased in complexity year-by-year. The majority of these presentations were followed by question-and-answer periods that conveyed the interest of a curious and open-minded audience.

Examining the AAAS' mission and criteria for disaffiliation, the author concludes that the PA's affiliation with the AAAS is likely to remain untested. A member-facing association organized very similarly to the PA, the AAAS is more occupied by its mission of service than the gate-keeping image that some have put upon it. On occasions where they were thrust into the role of gate-keeper, the governance of the AAAS behaved fairly and dispassionately, which in most cases worked out in favor of parapsychology as a science. Rather than asking if parapsychology is inside or outside the gates of science, it may be more productive to question the very metaphor, and look at how we can support the AAAS's mission of service.

Parapsychological Association
Columbus, OH, USA

STIMULATING PROGRESS IN PARAPSYCHOLOGY: PROSPECTIVE META-ANALYSIS

Caroline A. Watt¹ & James E. Kennedy²

In 2012, the authors launched the Koestler Parapsychology Unit (KPU) Registry for Parapsychological Experiments. Study registration is a valuable tool that helps to eliminate or identify many questionable research practices in individual studies and thereby enhances the methodological quality of an area of research. Researchers employ meta-analysis to quantitatively combine methodologically similar studies. When conducting a meta-analysis, they must make decisions about what data to include and what statistical methods to use. If researchers do this after knowing the outcomes of the studies, the decisions may be biased. Preregistration of individual studies does not eliminate potential biases that emerge from decisions during a meta-analysis. Retrospective meta-analyses are similar to exploratory research because methodological decisions are made after the study outcomes are known. Prospective meta-analyses are a form of preregistered confirmatory research because the analyses and the data that will be included are specified and ideally publicly registered before the studies are conducted.

The present paper uses ganzfeld ESP research to illustrate the limitations of retrospective meta-analysis, and to highlight how registration-based prospective meta-analysis can help to resolve debates over the evidence for psi and stimulate progress in parapsychology. For the first time, we present a summary of the KPU ganzfeld ESP studies, and note the decisions facing anyone seeking to evaluate their combined outcome. We then discuss the wider ganzfeld ESP database, which has been evaluated in a series of meta-analyses from 1985 to 2010. In each case, discussion has ensued over how to interpret the findings, as occurred for example following the 1999 meta-analysis by Milton and Wiseman. Here, discussion included

the definition of standard ganzfeld, statistical methods, and the meta-analysis cutoff date. The discussion of the Milton and Wiseman meta-analysis demonstrates the latitude in making decisions for a retrospective meta-analysis and, most importantly, the potential for bias either pro or con the psi hypothesis.

We then introduce a prospective meta-analysis of ganzfeld ESP studies that will be placed on the KPU Study Registry following review by parapsychologists and critics. The ganzfeld prospective meta-analysis protocol is preregistered and will make use of future study registrations to prospectively decide which studies will be included and what statistical test will be employed to assess the combined outcome. Any qualifications or modifications for the use of a study will also be specified prospectively on the list of included studies. This approach to meta-analysis does not limit process-oriented research or innovation, but simply specifies what studies will be included in a subsequent meta-analysis before the results of the studies are known.

Finally, we consider how prospective meta-analysis could be applied to other lines of parapsychological research, and summarize the many benefits of prospective meta-analysis for parapsychology.

¹ *Koestler Parapsychology Unit*

University of Edinburgh, Scotland, UK

² *Colorado, USA*

PANEL: THE TRICKSTER COMPANION OF PARAPSYCHOLOGY AND ANOMALISTICS

Renaud Evrard (Chair)

The relationship between paranormal phenomena and the trickster figure of mythology has been long recognized (e.g., Radin et al., 1956; Combs & Holland, 1990). *The Trickster and the Paranormal* (2001) by Hansen gave an extended overview of applications of the concept to the fields of parapsychology and anomalistics. It addressed their institutions, history, research, theories, paradoxes, and personnel. The paranormal seems to have affinities with certain social characteristics (e.g., liminality, antistructure, marginality, communitas, transgressiveness, reflexivity, reversibility) and aversions to others (e.g., centrality, structure, hierarchy, bureaucratic power). In sum, trickster theory describes a recurrent socioanthropological pattern that makes intelligible some ordinary observations in our fields, when taken in hindsight. But does this fruitful theory make specific predictions that would make it testable? What is its empirical basis? And what are its limits?

With this panel discussion, we offer an opportunity to address an often neglected theory that illustrates how the humanities may shed light on paranormal research.

Combs, A., & Holland, M. (1990). *Synchronicity: Science, myth, and the trickster*. New York: Paragon House.

Hansen, G. P. (2001). *The trickster and the paranormal*. Philadelphia, PA: Xlibris.

Radin, P., with commentaries by Kerenyi, K., Jung, C. G. (1956). *The trickster: A study in Native American mythology*. New York, NY: Schocken Books.

University of Lorraine, Nancy, France

THE PARANORMAL, THE TRICKSTER, AND STRUCTURALIST CONCEPTS

George P. Hansen

For thousands of years, humans have used religious rituals to influence, channel, and hedge off paranormal/supernatural forces. They have used myths to describe, explain, and understand those forces. Half a century ago, ritual and myth were illuminated by anthropologists (e.g., Claude Lévi-Strauss, Edmund Leach, Victor

Turner, Rodney Needham) using structuralist ideas. Concepts developed by them and later poststructuralists (e.g., Jacques Derrida) apply to the paranormal. Structuralist approaches often used comparative analyses, which are commonly employed in the humanities but less often in the sciences. They facilitate development of nonreductionistic theoretical perspectives.

The trickster is a character type found worldwide in myth. He embodies a collection of abstract qualities, including disruption, deception, marginality, supernatural powers, transgression, boundary crossing, and violation of sexual taboos. These qualities may manifest in individuals, small groups, even entire cultures. Structuralism's ideas gave insight into the trickster; the works of Barbara Babcock and Laura Makarius are noteworthy in this regard.

Pertinent concepts include binary oppositions, liminality, antistructure, *communitas*, *betwixt and between*, interstitiality, and status reversal—all are directly related to *classification*. These ideas illumine marginality, outsiderhood, stigma, and magic. All help explain the nature of psi as well as the position of the paranormal in Western culture.

Psi subverts commonly accepted categories. It blurs the boundaries between the binaries of self and other (telepathy), present and future (precognition), present and absent (clairvoyance), mind and matter (PK). But psi categories themselves break down; clear distinctions among them cannot be made. The labels can designate experimental procedures, but they do not identify different psi mechanisms. Likewise, the century-long debates on super psi versus spirit communication reflect similar problems of classification.

Earlier cultures used rituals to mark transitions such as child to adult or living to dead; the rituals typically included an in-between (or liminal) period that highlighted transitional conditions. The liminal realm is an area of indeterminacy and ambiguity (and is sometimes sacred); within it, customary rules and social roles are suspended. Characteristics of liminality include social instability, change, flux, transition, fluidity; it thus has parallels with William Braud's model of lability and inertia in psi processes.

Liminality and its governing archetype, the trickster, tend to subvert or dissolve hierarchical social structures. The term *anti-structure* expresses that quality. Psi is frequently accompanied by antistructural effects. Ghost research groups rarely achieve long-term existence and almost never own buildings or employ fulltime staff. Parapsychology laboratories never became securely integrated into mainstream bureaucratic institutions of government, industry, or academe.

Social marginality is a type of liminality. Parapsychology is marginalized and stigmatized. Marilyn Schlitz, in her Parapsychological Association presidential address in year 2000, explicitly disavowed the use of the word *parapsychology*. There may be no better illustration of the stigma and marginality of the field. For more than a century, parapsychologists have striven for respectability and general acceptance by cultural elites. They failed. Any comprehensive theory of psi must explain this plight.

East Windsor, NJ, USA

COMING TO TERMS WITH THE TRICKSTER

James E. Kennedy

The failure to produce convincingly reliable psi effects after 80 years of experimental research indicates that fundamental factors are not yet understood for the operation of psi. George Hansen's characterization of the paranormal as a trickster includes the property that psi effects can be striking and reliable for a period of time, but then seem to actively avoid sustained or useful effects.

The working assumptions for most parapsychologists are that psi is an unconscious process that is directed by human motivation and generally operates without conscious awareness and without conscious intention. The trickster properties of psi indicate that more is involved than just the motivations of the participants and experimenters. Anyone who has motivation about the existence or occurrence of psi could unconsciously use psi to influence the world to conform to their motivations. The outcome of psi experiments may be influenced by the social and cultural background of motivations and associated psi. Competition

among different motivations could produce unreliable psi effects.

Another hypothesis for the trickster nature of psi is that psi effects are due to influences from people in the future acting backwards in time or from entities in additional dimensions such as spirits of deceased persons, angels, god(s), karma, or some type of dualistic higher consciousness. These ideas are not scientifically parsimonious, but they are by far the most common explanations throughout human history. They reflect the fact that people typically experience paranormal phenomena as something that happens to them, not something that they do, as is assumed for experiments. The lack of scientific progress is a good indication that the past parsimonious parapsychological assumptions may not be applicable.

Experimental research with good methodological standards should in the next few years resolve the debates about the validity of the trickster ideas. The weaker methodological practices in the past may have obscured the trickster characteristics of psi. If the trickster ideas prove to be correct, those whose interest in psi is based on control and application—the masculine approach as described by Rhea White—will probably abandon psi research.

The striking differences among people in the occurrence of and attitudes toward paranormal phenomena need to be recognized and investigated. People appear to be living in different worlds with regard to the paranormal and often seem to have little ability to comprehend and accept other worldviews. Researchers need to recognize and to compensate for their own biases. This includes skeptics who are biased against the possibility of psi and parapsychologists who are biased against the possibility of supernatural entities. Psychological, sociological, religious, cultural, and life-event factors all need to be considered in understanding the differences in worldviews about the paranormal.

I also think that it is important to distinguish between experiences that appear to be truly paranormal versus experiences that are likely wishful thinking or other mistaken interpretations. Based on my experiences, actual paranormal experiences may be a component of a larger supernatural factor that creates a destiny for a person to have certain opportunities, experiences, and challenges in life.

Colorado, USA

WHY YOU ARE SO SCARY: UNDERSTANDING THE DEMONIZATION
OF PARAPSYCHOLOGY AMONG EVANGELICAL
AND FUNDAMENTALIST COMMUNITIES

Jeffrey J. Kripal

The present paper is a development of the last section of my J. B. Rhine Lecture in 2014 entitled “Authors of the Impossible: What the Humanities Have to Offer Parapsychology.” I want to pick up here where I left off there and address some of the contemporary Evangelical and fundamentalist readings of parapsychology as “demonic.” More specifically, I want to read these as a distorted insight into the Trickster, transgressive or antistructural nature of paranormal phenomena. I will engage the work of George Hansen on the antistructural nature of psi phenomena and put this in conversation with the work of the historian of religions Rudolf Otto on the left-handed sacred, the philosopher Georges Bataille on the mystical dimensions of transgression, some recent work on the mythical figure of Satan as a Trickster figure, and the scholarly literature on the paranormal in Roman Catholic hagiography and theology (where it tends to be much more appreciated).

My paper will engage the question of why parapsychology is still the object of various marginalizing, misinformation, and maligning strategies from both cultural elites and religious leaders. As these strange bedfellows suggest, parapsychology occupies a most interesting liminal or both-and position in the broader culture, somehow managing to offend both ends of the ideological spectrum.

On the secular side, I think the primary reason parapsychology is rejected is because its basic theoretical impulses around the nature of mind represent an implicit challenge to the base metaphysics of modernity and its instrumental reason, namely, materialism and mechanism. This is hardly news to you. So let me proceed immediately to the religious reasons, which I think are much deeper historically, trickier to

understand, and so much more difficult to get a handle on and answer.

I think there are at least three religious reasons that parapsychology is rejected and psi is feared. None of these are necessarily conscious reasons. Indeed, I suspect they are usually operating partly or even entirely unconsciously.

The first is what I will call the *problem of deification*. It is a direct function or result of Christian theology and is particularly prominent in American culture. I would not universalize this problem and suspect that the dynamics are very different in other theological contexts, say, in Jewish or Islamic contexts, and I know they are very different in Hindu, Buddhist, and Daoist ones. The second reason is what I will call the *problem of religious authority*. This problem can be found in different theological contexts and in different degrees. Again, I would not universalize it. The third is what I will call the *problem of black magic*. Historically speaking, it is the deepest of the three. It is also, I think, the one most resistant to an adequate response or resolution. Alas, it can probably be universalized.

I fully realize that none of these theological, institutional, and deep historical backgrounds easily translates into a conscious strategy of response or defense in our present. Indeed, I think some of it, if made fully conscious and public, might well make the backlash worse. Still, there is also a part of me that thinks that this deep religious background to the resistance does indeed help. For one thing, it makes sense of the otherwise senseless. For another, it makes the unconscious conscious. For still another, it can help us to better understand and appreciate our own intellectual radicalism.

Rice University, Houston, TX, USA

PA INVITED ADDRESSES

FOR THE 2014 OUTSTANDING CONTRIBUTION AWARD:

THE CASE FOR DREAM ESP RESEARCH: A CONTEXTUALISED REVIEW OF STUDY OUTCOMES FROM THE UNIVERSITY OF NORTHAMPTON

Chris A. Roe

Much recent work in parapsychology has concentrated on measuring unconscious responses to target stimuli or involve implicit psi tasks masked by conventional cognitive tasks. While these approaches are certainly worthwhile, they have little to say about the kinds of macroscopic spontaneous experience that prompted the foundation of the Society for Psychical Research or which preoccupy the general public today—if parapsychologists aspire to be employed in the university sector and paid from the public purse then it can reasonably be argued that their research must reflect that public's concerns. Many spontaneous psychic experiences involve altered states of consciousness (ASCs) in one form or another, and I will argue that this should again become a primary focus for parapsychology. Ganzfeld and dream ESP research seem to have fallen out of favour but continue to produce significant results (Storm, Sherwood, Roe, Tressoldi, Rock, & Di Risio, submitted). Indeed, it could be argued that these studies have been much more successful than we have any right to expect (cf. Roe, 2009), given a general presumption that “one-size-fits-all” when it comes to ASC induction (Rex Stanford refers to this as the “delusion of operational omnipotence”), which is exacerbated by the tendency for researchers not to monitor whether participants have actually experienced an altered state at all. It is therefore surprising that the number of studies utilising ASCs has dwindled in recent times when they seem to provide the most reliable method of capturing psi effects. In this presentation I will argue for a renewed interest in dream ESP research by summarizing those studies (published and unpublished) that have been undertaken at the University of Northampton, with a particular emphasis on process research that was intended to explore underlying patterns or mechanisms.

*Centre for the Study of Anomalous Psychological Processes
University of Northampton, Northampton, UK*

FOR THE 2015 OUTSTANDING CONTRIBUTION AWARD:

FINDING YOUR TEACHER: PUTTING TOGETHER A SHARED
EDUCATIONAL EXPERIENCE IN PARAPSYCHOLOGY

Nancy L. Zingrone

First, let me say I am grateful for the PA's recent recognition of my work. Thank you for the opportunity to talk about what online education can do for us, and why it's not just students and lab assistants who need to look online.

Here's the context: We all know there are individuals in the field who believe there is no point in scientifically studying parapsychology because all this is intrinsically unknowable, who know they already understand it all and we just need to accept that fact, or who argue that an academic degree inhibits scientific progress because they—who usually have less education—feel sorry for all of us who are confused by having too much. We all have a point of view. Whether congenial or uncongenial, the push and pull of scientific discourse really does enrich our field. But how productive is the conversation when we lack shared educational experiences?

When you look around a convention hall do you assume we're all on a similar page? We aren't. There are people here who don't know who Frederic Myers was or how his work inspired Ed Kelly and his colleagues to write *Irreducible Mind* or *Beyond Physicalism*. Many of your colleagues can't name a single important researcher outside their own language group. We are a well-educated community and we aren't. Because we usually master only the specific area we have chosen within a program dedicated to something else, we can be fundamentally uninformed about our field as a whole.

If the solution to this dilemma is the establishment of accredited programs of study that are *not* confined to a single course, are *not* an undergraduate minor with a wider purview, are *not* a year of modules on selected aspects of the field, are *not* a higher degree in a different discipline altogether, we are likely to have to wait 50 years for a shared educational experience that occurs in an on-site context.

Many of us are unwilling or unable to wait that long.

Recently Carlos and I have become involved with the International University of Graduate Studies on Dominica. Our goal is to develop eight to 10 deep courses on the breadth of the field as part of a postgraduate diploma, a postgraduate certificate, a masters or a Ph.D. that will not, however, transfer easily to the accredited schools of the world. IUGS is accredited only by the local government and the tuition is standard for online degree completion schools. Not a perfect solution, we admit, but at least they have supported our intention to provide IUGS students with a high-quality systematic program on the field. We're hoping that, some day, intellectual animosity towards parapsychology will lessen enough to permit a more transferable form of accreditation or a parapsychology-specific program in a more conventionally accredited school. We know it's a gamble but we think it's worthwhile.

So unfortunately, as always, a deep understanding of the field is most likely to rest on individual effort. What we want to emphasize strongly is, just because you are already conducting research or teaching students, do *not* presume the new online opportunities are *not* for you. There is value in the varied courses and certificates of the Rhine Education Center, and in Caroline Watt's KPU-based online course, especially if you have entered the field from another discipline. The content of an increasing number of YouTube channels such as those of the PF, the PA, our own Parapsychology Online channel, Jeff Mishlove's New Thinking Allowed, the IONS and SSE channels add significantly to the serious material that's available and useful for all of us.

So let's talk about the ParaMOOC series. First, MOOC means Massively Open Online Course. In 2008 when the first one of these online courses was taught by Canadian educators Stephen Downes and Dave Cormier on connectivist education, 700+ students was considered a massive course. Now that there's Coursera out there with hundreds of thousands of students per course, the ParaMOOC series is sort of a mini-Mooc. Carlos and I started the first one as a spare time activity when we were just starting to work for

the Parapsychology Foundation again in 2015 because I was familiar with the social media teaching platform WizIQ and our limited internet service could handle it. Now the series is part of our work for the PF.

Over 1,200 students participated in the ParaMOOCs over the last 2 years. Our 2015 backlog of ParaMOOC presentations to be uploaded this year to Parapsychology Online on YouTube include talks by Richard Broughton, Thomas Rabeyron, Roger Nelson, Dean Radin, and Peter Bancel, with many others recorded. Also to be uploaded to the Parapsychology Foundation channel is the 2016 backlog which includes talks by Patrizio Tressoldi, Dick Bierman, Renaud Evrard, Bernard Carr, and Stefan Schmidt, among others. But the PF also has an enormous backlog of audio and video interviews, courses, and conference presentations from the Foundation's 65 years of operation. So there is a lot more to come there to the PF channel. With more than 5,800 views on our 2-year-old channel and over 1,200 views on the PF 13-month-old channel, we can say confidently that our efforts have reduced the field's invisibility at least somewhat.

Make no mistake: The affordances of online education for shared education are massive and powerful. Take Coursera for example. Free education and paid certificate programs are available from top universities around the world in scores of languages. Not only has this changed the shape of modern education for conventional college students but also for individuals for whom university-based education was impossible prior to online education. Small institutions, individual educators, and universities are expanding their virtual footprints even into massively multiplayer online role playing games (MMORPGs) such as *Lord of the Rings Online*. Kahn Academy, SciShow and Minute Earth on YouTube, the International Society of Technology in Education's Virtual Environments Network in Second Life, the Camelot multiplatform online language learning projects, all these have revolutionized instruction all over the world. These and other projects—even our own The AZIRE Library and Learning Center in Second Life—are transforming the landscape for learners of all kinds. Preliminary research from a variety of online teaching and practice journals show that retention of material is not only better in online environments but the learning transfers to the real world more effectively than conventional lecture hall learning.

For a field like ours—situated unhappily in a contested political space—these efforts are extremely important, we think. And so convenient! Where else but online can you sit at your desk or on the Tube heading home and enjoy an hour or more of colleagues describing their work on your iPhone or Surface Pro? If you watch an online offering live and participate in the Q&A, the experience builds community as well. And ParaMOOC? One speaker per day—time limited only by how long the speaker and students want to keep on talking—is so much better than the 30 minutes and done convention model for an in-depth understanding of the topic at hand.

There is no need for us to wait 50 years for a shared educational experience. It's here, and we can take advantage of it as learners and contribute to it as teachers.

Parapsychology Foundation, New York, NY, USA

FOR THE 2015 CHARLES HONORTON INTEGRATIVE CONTRIBUTIONS AWARD:

CONSCIOUSNESS AND THE DOUBLE-SLIT

Dean Radin

If the path that photons take through a double-slit interferometer is known by any means, then the photons will behave like particles, otherwise they will behave like waves. There are numerous interpretations of this effect, known as the “quantum measurement problem.” One of the earliest proposed solutions, by John von Neumann, was based on characterization of the measurement process as a chain of interactions between physical entities—e.g., physical system, detector, eye, brain—with the process ending only when knowledge of the measurement is registered by what von Neumann called an “extra-physical” factor, that is, the observer's mind. In a series of 17 experiments with various optical systems, we put von Neumann's proposal to the test. Participants focused their attention toward or away from an optical system while interference patterns were measured. The hypothesis was that the act of conscious observation would cause a

change in interference. Some experiments were conducted in the lab, others over the Internet to rigorously isolate the observers from the optical apparatus. Overall the evidence strongly supported the hypothesis, but with a surprise. Observation did not always “collapse” the wavefunction, as we had expected. Rather, the interference pattern became sharper or more diffuse depending on the observers’ intentions, where intention was operationally defined by the nature of the feedback used to link the observers to the optical system. This outcome is consistent with consciousness as an active “steering force” rather than as a passive observer. It is also consistent with a half century of prior research using other targets of mental intention. These studies therefore suggest that the observer is an active participant in the formation of physical reality. I will suggest a framework for understanding these effects as predictable rather than anomalous. That framework requires no changes to existing scientific models, just a modification to the metaphysical assumptions underlying science itself.

Institute of Noetic Sciences, Petaluma, CA, USA

PA PRESIDENTIAL ADDRESS

AS IT OCCURRED TO ME: LESSONS LEARNED IN RESEARCHING PARAPSYCHOLOGICAL CLAIMS

Chris A. Roe

Deciding what to discuss in a presidential address provides a welcome opportunity for reflection—after being actively involved in parapsychological research for 25 years, how has my perspective changed? What do I know now that I didn’t know when I began? I do not mean simply in terms of which experimental outcomes proved statistically significant or which themes emerged from qualitative data analysis, but what did I discover about the phenomena, my participants, and also about myself as a consequence of my active participation as a student, researcher, collaborator, and mentor? What painful lessons could I share with those at the start of their career that might save them some time, effort, and trouble? What insights presented themselves to me in the margins of research, from conversations with participants during debrief, from encounters with psychic practitioners in situ, and from interactions with researcher colleagues both within and without parapsychology? My presentation will inevitably have a biographical flavour, but will use that structure to provide a foundation for considering wider issues, such as the tension between the need for clarity and control, and for authenticity and ecological validity, when designing studies; the relative merits of qualitative and quantitative approaches, and the value of a transpersonal orientation to understanding psi; the dynamic interpersonal nature of research with a sentient subject and the effect this has on outcome consistency; the negative impact of our funding model upon the way in which parapsychology is organised; and the need to invest in professional development at undergraduate and postgraduate levels to ensure the long term viability of the discipline.

*Centre for the Study of Anomalous Psychological Processes
University of Northampton, Northampton, UK*

J. B. RHINE BANQUET ADDRESS

THE SECRETS OF THE HEART: EMPATHY & ANOMALOUS/TRANSPERSONAL EXPERIENCES

Ian Wickramasekera

Dr. Ian Wickramasekera II will discuss the powerful transpersonal nature of empathy that sometimes gives rise to anomalous experiences. The keynote address will discuss how anomalous and transpersonal experi-

riences have often been reported to arise from deep experiences of empathy through practicing techniques such as hypnosis and compassion related meditation practices (Chod and Tonglen). The presentation will cover perspectives and practices from ancient spiritual traditions, classic psychological theorists, as well as modern psychological and psychophysiological research conducted by Dr. Wickramasekera and others. The presentation will end with a consideration of what might be gained through studying empathy and compassion to further understand “the secrets of the heart.”

Naropa University, Boulder, CO, USA